**A2Ethics Case Writing Rubric for Judges**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Beginning  (1 pt.) | Developing  (2 pts) | Accomplished (3 pts.) | Exemplary  (4 pts.) |
| **Clear articulation of ethical issue** | No specific issue is named | Issue can be implied, but is not clearly stated or recognizable as an ethics problem (and not primarily economic, social or political) | Issue is clearly stated and begins to identify an ethics problem (and not primarily economic, social or political) | Issue is both clearly stated and presents a complex ethics problem |
| **Clearly presented moral complications of that issue** | No moral complications present | Problem implies limited moral complications, (e.g., only one reasonable argument, action-guiding principle, or moral norm) | Problem implies some moral complications (e.g., two reasonable arguments, action-guiding principles, or moral norms) | Problem is presented as extremely morally complicated  (e.g., implies several reasonable arguments, diverse action-guiding principles, moral norms) |
| **Study questions** | No study questions included | Study questions are provided, but do not highlight the moral dimensions of the case | Study questions highlight the moral dimensions, but assume “right” and “wrong” responses | Study questions highlight the moral dimensions, and do not assume “right” and “wrong” responses |
| **Background/**  **contextual setting** | Little to no context (background information about profession or occupation, situation, characters, etc.) | Some contextual information, but not enough background to offer readers the specifics they need to thoroughly discuss the case | Sufficient contextual information that provides a basis for discussion of the case | Comprehensive contextual information that provides both background and specifics that can lead to a rich discussion of the case |
| **Creativity** | Underlying issue and/or framing are not original, unique and do not offer a chance for novel exploration | Issue is original or unique, but the context or framing of events or characters seems inauthentic, formulaic and disengaged | Case provides an original or unique approach to a recognizable issue with events and characters that are authentic and engaged | Case provides an original or unique approach to a new and fresh issue, relying on events and characters that are authentic and engaged |
| **Writing quality: Organization/awareness**  **Style and**  **conventions** | Case is difficult for readers to follow and numerous errors in language conventions get in the way of readers’ understanding, including no clear organizational structure or transitions between sections, sentence structure, punctuation, etc. | Case is somewhat easy for readers to follow, but lacks clear organization and/or transitions with some errors in language conventions, e.g., sentence structure, punctuation, etc. | Case is mostly  easy for readers to follow and has a clear organizational structure and/or some transitions with minimal errors in language conventions that do not get in the way of readers’ understanding | Case is easy for readers to follow, has a clear organizational structure and transitions that guide the readers from one idea to the next, language conventions that are accepted, equitable and enhance the readers’ understanding, all of which make it compelling to read |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |